The PLOTINA Gender Equality Plan at the Università di Bologna: best practices for a better science

T. Gallina Toschi, A. Balzano, F. Crivellaro, E. Luppi, D. Sangiorgi, B. Siboni.

Alma Mater Studiorum - Università di Bologna (UNIBO), Italy

Project H2020 (2015-2020) GA n° 666008 coordinated by
Alma Mater Studiorum – Università di Bologna
Prof. Tullia Gallina Toschi
PLOTINA is an EU funded H2020 project that started in February 2016 (total duration: 48 months).

The overall objective of PLOTINA is to enable the development, implementation and assessment of self-tailored Gender Equality Plans with innovative strategies for the RPOs involved. This objective is based on the vision to foster excellence and the social value of innovation, by: stimulating a gender-aware culture change; promoting career-development of researchers to prevent the waste of talent, particularly for women; ensuring diversification of views in research and teaching.

PLOTINA aims at: preventing underutilization of qualified female researchers by removing barriers to recruitment, retention and career progression, allowing the EU to benefit from the talents of all its researchers; improving decision making by addressing gender imbalances; incorporating the sex/gender dimension in research especially where not applied.

Alma Mater Studiorum-Università di Bologna, UNIBO (Italia); Kemijski Inštitut-National Institute of Chemistry, NIC (Slovenia); Mondragon Unibersitatea, MU (Spagna); Zentrum fuer Soziale Innovation GMBH, ZSI (Austria); Ozyegin Universitesi, OZU (Turchia); Centro Studi Progetto Donna e Diversity MGMT, PD (Italia); University of Warwick (UK); Lisbon School of Economics and Management, ISEG (Portogallo); Elhuyar Aholkularitza (Spagna), Elhuyar Komunikazioa (Spagna).
Since 2017, the Alma Mater Studiorum Università di Bologna (UNIBO) is implementing a Gender Equality Plan (GEP).

To reduce the leaky pipeline phenomenon and to promote a gender-aware science in Research Performing Organisations (RPOs), only a multi-layered strategy can be effective.
Observing the typical pattern for academic careers at UNIBO the **leaky pipeline effect became evident**: the female predominance trend amongst students enrolled (55% women to 45% men in 2016) and graduates (58% women to 42% men in 2016) is inverted for the gender ratio amongst PhD students (47% women and 51% men). These numbers are fully reversed amongst tenured researchers, full professors and associate professors, where male predominance is clearly evident (men in 2016 made up 76% of full professors, women only the 24%).
The integration of Gender in Research

Considering the overall data on the integration of the gender/sex variables in research, it is evident the lack of awareness and sensitivity on gender/sex issues.

A survey delivered to all coordinators of research programs financed in 2015 (66) shows that the majority of respondents do not disaggregate data by sex/gender and do not integrate those variables in research.
With its GEP UNIBO would like to contribute to the achievement of the Sustainable Development Goals identified by UN as key priorities for the 2030. UNIBO has already embraced UN Development Goals, as its Strategic Plan 2016-2018 shows. In particular UNIBO PLOTINA Team will focus on the Goals numbers 5 (Gender Equality) and 10 (Reduce Inequality).
Best Practices from UNIBO GEPs

1.1 the Annual Gender Report publication, to monitor the gender and diversity state of the art in the organization disaggregating quantitative and qualitative data by gender;

1.2 the introduction, in internal research evaluation procedures, of the consideration of maternity and parental leave periods;

1.3 the internal training seminars on the use of sex and gender perspective in research, to foster the acknowledgement of its economic, social and innovation value.
PLOTINA best practice for gendering research

LIST OF GOOD PRACTICES for gender equality and sex and gender perspective integration in research and researchers

Researchers and research: gender equality and sex and gender perspective
PLOTINA best practice for gendering research

- **EXPECTED OUTCOMES:** the dissemination of gender aware research. Two training seminars at Departmental and Institutional level: Engineering School, Social and Political Sciences Department.

- **IMPLEMENTATION:** with ARIC – Research Area Administrative Division – and Alma Gender IRT the PLOTINA Team fostered the creation of a multidisciplinary group of experts, with STEM and SSH backgrounds. The group met twice and conducted internal seminars in 2017: the first targeting Engineering researchers; the second targeting SSH researchers. Engineering was identified as a privileged Department to start because, in this field, the integration of sex and gender in research is still at the beginning. After the seminars, participants received a pdf document including all the teaching materials used by speakers.

- **RESULTS:** 27 Unibo staff members (researchers, professors, PhD students) participated in both seminars and had the occasion to enhance their knowledge on the use of the sex and gender perspective and on the funding opportunities provided by H2020. An evaluation questionnaire was delivered to participants.

- **EVALUATION:** As for the seminar of the 24th of November at the Engineering School, all participants rated its contents as useful, interesting and stimulating. The 100% of participants think that the seminar’s contents can be applied in their field of research. As for the seminar of the 7th of December at the Social and Political Sciences Department all participants rated it as useful and stimulating, 25% of participants rated its contents as advanced, and 75% as interesting. For both seminars all participants answered that the information acquired met their expectations.

- **LESSONS LEARNT/TRANSFERABILITY/REFLECTION:** Utilising UNIBO human resources competences, skills and knowledge could enable UNIBO to make this action sustainable in the future.
PLOTINA best practice for career progression

LIST OF GOOD PRACTICES for recruitment, career progression and retention

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY AREA</th>
<th>NAME OF THE ACTION</th>
<th>TYPE OF ACTION</th>
<th>MAIN AIM OF THE ACTION</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION TYPE</th>
<th>LEVEL OF IMPLEMENTATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment, career progression</td>
<td>Introduction in internal research evaluation of procedures of the consideration of maternity and parental leave</td>
<td>Positive action/policy</td>
<td>The main objective of this action is to grant an equal evaluation of the scientific production and research of both female and male UNIBO academic staff.</td>
<td>Alma Mater Studiorum - Universita Di Bologna</td>
<td>Higher education institution</td>
<td>Researchers and professors</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PLOTINA best practice for career progression

- **EXPECTED IMPACT:** A more equal evaluation of both female and male academic staff’s research and scientific production; attention to the issue of equal assessment/evaluation as a structural gender policy within the RPO.
- **IMPLEMENTATION:** In 2017 University Research Evaluation (assessing 2016 Unibo academic staff’s scientific production) it has been introduced a clause that takes into account maternity leaves and time off work. On the one hand, some UNIBO key actors and decision makers – namely: the Research Vice Rector; the Guarantee Committee for Equal Opportunities, Employee Wellbeing and Non Discrimination at Work (CUG); the Rector’s Delegate for Gender Equality; Human Resources Administrative Division – will have the responsibility to monitor annually the application/retention of the evaluation criteria that consider maternity and parental leaves in the University Research Evaluation Board procedures. On the other hand, the University Research Evaluation Board have the responsibility to apply the criteria. The UNIBO Plotina Team will monitor the retention of the clause. The Human Resources Administrative Division will monitor the application of the clause.
- **RESULTS:** The action allows a more equal research evaluation system. Women and men who decide to take parental leaves have more time to develop their research records which could lead to a better evaluation of their work. In the short term, women – who often take more caring responsibilities than men – can be evaluated on more equal grounds.
- **EVALUATION:** In the long term, men might be encouraged to take parental leaves and take more caring responsibilities. Women might feel more supported in taking family care responsibilities and might be more likely to be assessed positively (by evaluators acknowledging the time devoted on caring) leading to career development and progression.
## PLOTINA best practices for the governance bodies

### LIST OF GOOD PRACTICES for the governance bodies, key actors and decision-makers

The governance bodies, key actors and decision-makers

### Key 2 Recruitmentwomangrisa

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>KEY AREA</th>
<th>NAME OF THE ACTION</th>
<th>TYPE OF ACTION</th>
<th>MAIN AIM OF THE ACTION</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION</th>
<th>ORGANIZATION TYPE</th>
<th>LEVEL OF IMPLEMENTATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The governance bodies, key actors and decision-makers</td>
<td>Monitoring gender and diversity state of art in the organization, gathering and analysing gender disaggregated quantitative data</td>
<td>Data gathering and analysis</td>
<td>Analysis of the data on the composition of teaching staff, administrative staff and students by gender at Unibo as a whole, as well as broken down by Departments and Schools. This will indicate the situation of vertical and horizontal segregation, and</td>
<td>Alma Mater Studiorum – Universita Di Bologna</td>
<td>Higher education institution</td>
<td>Researchers/professors and technical and administrative staff, students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
PLOTINA best practice for the governance bodies

• MAIN AIM OF THE ACTION: Analysis of the data on the composition of teaching staff, administrative staff and students by gender at Unibo as a whole, as well as broken down by Departments and Schools. This will indicate the situation of vertical and horizontal segregation, and the ceiling glass effect.

• EXPECTED IMPACT: First, raising awareness among governing bodies, teaching and administrative staff as well as among students on vertical and horizontal segregation, on glass ceiling and on the urgency to undertake actions to solve them. Second, the monitoring and improving of critical situations, characterized by unequal conditions.

• IMPLEMENTATION: An interdisciplinary team collected data manually but mostly in digital format (from Unibo DataWarehouse) to draft the Gender Report. The Gender report was presented and approved in June 2017 by the Board of the University of Bologna, and it was presented during a Conference organised by the CUG held at Unibo in December 2017. Moreover, the Gender Report was presented in other two Conferences held in November and December 2017 at the University of Ferrara and of Padua, in order not only to spread Unibo experience and the results of the data collection carried out, but also to spread the methodology used by Unibo to elaborate the Gender Report. From December 2017, the Gender Report as well as two short versions of it (one in Italian and one in English) are online in the official website of Unibo (http://www.unibo.it/it/ateneo/chi-siamo/bilancio-di-genere; http://www.unibo.it/en/university/who-we-are/gender-budgeting).
PLOTINA best practice for the governance bodies

**LESSONS LEARNT/TRANSFERABILITY/REFLECTION:** A Unibo strength consists of its decision to have an office specifically dedicated to the data collection, ARAG, that centralizes the gathering of information at departmental and institutional level. CUG, through Plotina, required and obtained the resources to allow ARAG collecting data disaggregated by sex and gender. It is important to define specific deadlines to obtain the data. It is crucial to disseminate the document, both internally and externally. Specifically, it is important to enhance the visibility of the document to the governing bodies in order to encourage them to undertake specific actions aimed at improving gender equality where it is necessary.

**CHALLENGES:** The wide range of data to be collected and reported requires intensive work and a great amount of human and financial resources. Data on absences and leaves required specific analysis and a thoughtful reflection on the best way to present them in order to guarantee the anonymity of particular, sensitive situations. The gathering of such an amount of data was possible thanks to the support of a specific unit of the University of Bologna, namely ARAG (Evaluation and strategic planning unit).

**RESULTS:** On the short-term, the Annual Gender Report allows monitoring vertical and horizontal segregation and glass ceiling effects. It provides the evidences to legitimate gender equality policies and to overcome “gender fatigue” and potential resistances. On the long-term, the systematic data collection on gender distribution allows assessing whether and how the situation changes over time due to the GEP.
Plotina has received funding from the European Union’s Horizon 2020 research and innovation programme under grant agreement (G.A NO 666008). The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Commission.

Thank you for your attention

info@plotina.eu
www.plotina.eu